The Integration of Occupational Pension Regulations: Lessons for Canada

Martin Hering and Michael Kpessa McMaster University

SEDAP Conference on Private Pensions and Income Security in Old Age, Hamilton, November 15-17

Session 8: International Perspectives on Income Security in Old Age

Topic

- Recent initiatives to integrate occupational pension regulations across jurisdictions
- Canada: proposed principles for a pension model law (2004, 2005)
- European Union: pension fund directive (2003) and proposed portability directive (2005)
- International: OECD's principles for pension regulation and supervision (2004)

Questions

- Which obstacles make occupational pension integration politically difficult?
 - Canada: Reciprocal Agreement has not been updated or expanded since the 1960s
 - EU: single market in occupational pensions had been blocked for more than 10 years
- Which strategies could overcome these obstacles and make integration politically feasible?

Cases

Canada

- Only advanced industrialized country in which occupational pensions are regulated at the sub-national level
- Integration initiative by provincial pension regulators (CAPSA)

European Union

 Successful adoption of the pension fund directive despite of great diversity among occupational pension systems

Arguments

- Policy legacies in occupational pensions are a significant obstacle to integration
- Three strategies can make occupational pension integration politically feasible
 - Problem definition: protection of the diversity of occupational pension systems
 - Scope of regulation: focus on financial regulations, exclusion of social regulations
 - Methods of integration: use of different methods for financial and social regulations

Implications

- CAPSA's initiative for a pension model law will likely not lead to progress in occupational pension integration
 - Problem definition: sees diversity among occupational pension systems as a problem per se and does not seek to protect it
 - Scope of regulation: inclusion of social regulations
 - Method of integration: use of a single method for different types of regulation

Suggestions

- Progress in occupational pension integration in Canada would be more likely if policy-makers
 - tried to protect the diverse social regulations in provincial pension systems
 - focused on the integration of financial regulations
 - used multiple methods of integration (harmonization, mutual recognition, voluntary coordination)

Structure of the paper

- Obstacles to integration (policy legacies)
- Problems of fragmentation (problem definitions)
- Scope of regulation (policy alternatives)
- Lessons for Canada

Contact: Martin Hering < heringm@mcmaster.ca>